Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission Report

US

THE CITY OF
COLUMBUS
ANDREW J. GINTHER, MAYOR

This page is intentionally blank.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

Table of Contents

This page is intentionally blank.

OPENING LETTER FROM CHAIR JANET E. JACKSON TO MAYOR ANDREW J. GINTHER

This page is intentionally blank.

Opening Letter from Chair Janet E. Jackson to Mayor Andrew J. Ginther

January 28, 2020

In early 2018, I was asked by Mayor Andrew J. Ginther to serve as Chair of the newly formed Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission. I believe there are pivotal moments in our lives when we are called to serve our community. Serving on this Commission has been one of those moments.

My fellow commissioners are a vibrant and diverse group that includes community leaders, frontline social service providers, faith leaders, academics, and a current law enforcement officer. They live in neighborhoods across our city and, just as importantly, serve even more communities in their professional and volunteer roles.

The Commission was charged and tasked with reviewing Columbus Division of Police recruitment, training, policies and procedures. We focused on areas such as de-escalation, crisis intervention, and implicit bias training; use of force policies; diversity recruitment and retention; and early intervention and officer wellness programs. In each area, we assessed what the City of Columbus needs to do to provide public safety services that are transparent, accountable, and responsive for every person in every neighborhood.

Since April 2018, the Commission has thoroughly reviewed existing research of respected law enforcement and social justice experts. As part of this research, the Commission listened intently throughout 24 meetings as both internal and external experts presented tens of hours of law enforcement practices, policies, and procedures. We considered data from an extensive operational review of the Columbus Division of Police through the lens of 21st century policing, conducted by Matrix Consulting. Further, the Commission held two community public forums to listen to residents' concerns about their experiences with Columbus Police officers. The collected information speaks volumes to the many challenges that exist in the overlapping lives of both officers and residents. I strongly believe the Commission has diligently met the Mayor's charge.

Based on this portfolio of information and the focused work of four subcommittees, the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission is proud to present 80 recommendations to Mayor Andrew J. Ginther. These recommendations were approved in an October 2019 public meeting by a majority vote of Commissioners present. Each draft recommendation was considered on its own merits with an associated vote for, against, or an abstention from the motion.

Our hope is that these thoughtful recommendations will ensure that the Columbus Division of Police has the most effective training, policies and procedures to continue to be one of the best law enforcement agencies in the country.

Respectfully,
Janet E. Jackson, Chair, CCSAC

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

OVERVIEW OF COLUMBUS COMMUNITY SAFETY ADVISORY COMMISSION

This page is intentionally blank.

Overview of Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission

In November 2017, Mayor Andrew J. Ginther announced the creation of the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission to lead a transparent community process to identify, review, and recommend best practices to ensure the Columbus Division of Police has the best training, policies and procedures to protect and serve our entire community.

Community policing, problem-oriented policing, and associated best practices identified by national public safety and social justice experts have informed the Safety Commission's work. Key areas of focus include de-escalation, crisis intervention, and implicit bias training; use of force policies; diversity recruitment and retention; and early intervention and officer wellness programs. In each area, the Commission assessed what the City of Columbus needs to do to provide public safety services that are transparent, accountable, and responsive for every person in every neighborhood.

After a public application process, a total of 17 commissioners were appointed to the Commission by Mayor Ginther, with Commissioner Janet E. Jackson appointed as Chair. Chair Jackson has held many distinguished positions over the course of her career as the Columbus City Attorney, Franklin County Municipal Court Judge, and CEO of United Way of Central Ohio.

The city received 132 applications for the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission. Mayor Ginther requested recommendations that reflected diversity of thought, experience, and demographics. Appointees included community leaders, current and former safety officers, frontline social service providers, faith leaders, public safety practitioners, and academics.

The Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission was comprised of the following people:
- Janet E. Jackson, Chair, United Way of Central Ohio (retired)
- Brooke Burns, Office of the Ohio Public Defender
- Emily Buster, Ethiopian Tewahedo Social Services
- LaShaun Carter, Franklin County Children Services
- Tammy Fournier-Alsaada, Ohio Organizing Collaborative
- Dr. Chenelle Jones, Franklin University
- Dr. Vlad Kogan, The Ohio State University
- Matthew McCrystal, Public Safety professional
- Ellen Moore Griffin, Community Crime Patrol
- Andrea Morbitzer, Nationwide Children's Hospital
- Pastor Jason Ridley, Allegheny West Conference of Seventh-Day Adventist
- Traci Shaw, Columbus Division of Police
- Erin Synk, LNE Group
- Oleatha Waugh, Columbus Urban League
- Mary Wehrle, Jewish Family Services
- Tiffany White, Progressive Insurance Companies
- Dr. Reginald Wilkinson, Connecting the Dots, LLC

The following neighborhoods were directly represented on the Commission: Beechwold, Berwick, Clintonville, Discovery District, Franklin Park, Franklinton, Hilltop, Linden, Merion Village, Near East Side, North Linden, Northeast, Northwest, Olde Town East, Oriole Heights, Short North, and Weinland Park.

In the course of its work, Chair Jackson appointed Commissioners to four working subcommittees, which met periodically and developed many of the draft recommendations considered by the full Commission. The following subcommittees are listed by Chair and then members.

Hot Topics
- Dr. Vlad Kogan
- Dr. Reginald Wilkinson
- Tammy Fournier-Alsaada
- Tiffany White

21st Century Policing
- Dr. Chenelle A. Jones
- Oleatha Waugh
- Traci M. Shaw

Training
- Brooke Burns
- Mary Wehrle
- Ellen Moore Griffin
- Matthew McCrystal
- Jason Ridley

Hiring
- Andrea Morbitzer
- Shaun Carter
- Emily Buster
- Erin Synk

The following individuals provided staff support for the Commission:
- Bryan M. Clark, Chief Policy Advisor, Mayor Andrew J. Ginther
- Adam S. Friedman, Esq., Senior Policy Advisor, Mayor Andrew J. Ginther
- Elon Simms, Community Outreach Director, Mayor Andrew J. Ginther
- Denise Bauer, Executive Assistant, Mayor Andrew J. Ginther
- Lt. Jeffery A. Lipp, Department of Public Safety, Division of Police
- George Speaks, Deputy Director, Department of Public Safety
- Kate Pishotti, Deputy Director, Department of Public Safety
- Jeffrey Furbee, Chief Police Legal Advisor, Columbus City Attorney Zach Klein

The Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission held 24 meetings, including two public forum meetings, and established four subcommittees. The following is a chronological list of the meeting dates and topics:

- Meeting 1 - April 12th, 2018 - Introductions

- Meeting 2 – May 9th, 2018 – Legal Tactics for Law Enforcement Officers

- Meeting 3 – May 31st, 2018 – Constitutional Standards for Policing

- Meeting 4 – June 13th, 2018 – Civil Service Process for Hiring; CDP Selection Process and Background Investigation Process

- Meeting 5 – July 11th, 2018 – Recruitment SWOT; Recruitment Pipeline; Polygraph Overview; Police Hiring Process

- Meeting 6 – August 1st, 2018 – Community Engagement and Outreach

- Meeting 7 – August 20th, 2018 – Recruitment Data Analysis

- Meeting 8 – September 12th, 2018 – 21st Century Policing

- Meeting 9 – September 25th, 2018 – Training Bureau Overview; Ohio Peace Officer Training; Basic Training; Advanced Training; Crisis Intervention Training

- Meeting 10 – October 18, 2018 – Crisis Intervention Training; Matrix Consulting Presentation

- Meeting 11 – November 1st, 2018 – Collective Bargaining; FOP Contract

- Meeting 12 – November 14th, 2018 – Benchmark Analytics Presentation; Employee Action Review System Presentation

- Meeting 13 – December 13th, 2018 - Collective Bargaining; CDP Discipline Process; Arbitration

- Meeting 14 – January 10th, 2019 – Subcommittee Reports; Matrix Consulting Interim Report

- Meeting 15 – January 23rd, 2019 – Officer Wellness Presentation

- Meeting 16 – March 14, 2019 – Use of Force Presentation; CDP Directives

- Meeting 17 – March 27th, 2019 – Use of Force

- Meeting 18 - April 18th, 2019 – Juvenile Justice

- Meeting 19 – June 5th, 2019 – Public Forum

- Meeting 20 – July 15th, 2019- Subcommittee Updates

- Meeting 21 – September 6th, 2019 – Chief Quinlan and Matrix Presentations

- Meeting 22 – September 16th, 2019 – Subcommittee Presentations

- Meeting 23 – October 1st, 2019 – Public Forum

- Meeting 24 – October 22, 2019 – Final Commission Vote on Recommendations

January 28, 2020

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

Executive Summary

Based on information and data gleaned from 24 meetings and the work of Commissioners in four subcommittees, the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission ("CCSAC") developed and adopted 80 recommendations for Mayor Andrew J. Ginther. These recommendations are issued in concert with the final operations review report of the Columbus Division of Police by Matrix Consulting, the results of which were released prior to the adoption of these recommendations.

Recommendations were approved in a public meeting by a majority vote of Commissioners present. Each draft recommendation was considered on its own merits with an associated vote for, against, or an abstention from the motion. While the body of this report presents final recommendations, the subcommittee reports, additional recommendations, and meeting minutes include all draft recommendations, as well as the roster of those present and their vote on each motion.

The following is a complete list of recommendations to Mayor Andrew J. Ginther on behalf of the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission.

The Future of Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission

- **Recommendation 1:** Continue the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission.

- **Recommendation 2:** The Columbus Division of Police ("CDP") should track all Commission-approved recommendations in the CDP annual report as an Annex/Appendix/Attachment. This would provide for updates to the recommendations, available to the public. This would also create a level of accountability for all recommendation status, whether adopted by CDP or not, and create a document that allows for future leadership in an annual report format.

Recruitment

- **Recommendation 3:** The CDP Recruitment Unit shall be reassigned to the Human Resources Bureau with no patrol responsibilities.

- **Recommendation 4:** Establish a budget that realistically meets the needs for resources, Recruitment Unit personnel and related resource costs.

- **Recommendation 5:** Add civilian liaisons within recruiting division to New American and minority communities.

- **Recommendation 6:** Benchmark size of CDP recruiting staff/resources against comparable cities.

- **Recommendation 7:** Make recruiting materials available in multiple languages.

- **Recommendation 8:** Add a referral incentive to include underrepresented minorities with an intentional effort to recruit successful candidates who meet the hiring standards.

- **Recommendation 9:** Connect better pipeline for CDP recruitment and Explorer's program with Columbus State Community College ("CSSC") or other Career Technical Education programs.

- **Recommendation 10:** Co-recruit/referral to civilian jobs within the City if a potential recruit is not yet of age or fitness level.

- **Recommendation 11:** Establish a case management process to assign applicants to a specific point of contact who remains consistent throughout each step.

Testing

- **Recommendation 12:** Submit all testing materials for a third-party cultural relevancy and implicit bias review.

- **Recommendation** 13: There should be an independent audit of recruiting/testing process included in an annual report.

- **Recommendation 14:** Add bonus points for successful alumni of Explorers and Cadet programs and current civilian City employees.

- **Recommendation 15:** Add points for additional language fluency/competency/skill set on testing.

- **Recommendation 16:** Provide cultural competency training for those scoring the Columbus Oral Police Exam ("COPE").

- **Recommendation 17:** Maintain trained community members on COPE panel.

- **Recommendation 18:** Improve COPE scenario designs to bring out problematic bias.

January 28, 2020

Curriculum

- **Recommendation 19:** The CDP Training Academy should add and integrate specific language into training curriculum regarding crowd control that specifically addresses citizen's individual civil rights, including First Amendment rights and the right to protest, specifically relating to non-aggressive police tactics for non-violent protests/marches. This should also include the opportunities created to increase city/citizen engagement while allowing police to protect rather than using unnecessary violent tactics during non-violent situations.

- **Recommendation 20:** The CDP Training Academy should add and integrate specific language into training curriculum regarding access to language services. This should also be a refresher training required for all officers.

- **Recommendation 21:** Expand the CDP Training Academy juvenile justice training to include adolescent brain development, impact of trauma on the child brain, and why those topics are relevant to policing.

- **Recommendation 22:** Officers should be trained on how to modify behavior to de-escalate situations with youth.

- **Recommendation 23:** In developing and delivering training, include a civilian expert in the area of normative childhood development and adolescent brain development.

- **Recommendation 24:** Expand or modify the cultural competence [training] material to include cultural awareness training germane to the diverse residents/communities currently residing in the city of Columbus.

- **Recommendation 25:** Ensure that training materials, including videos, pictures, and PowerPoints, are inclusive, and not racially or culturally biased or triggering.

- **Recommendation 26:** Training materials should include officers of a racially/ethnically diverse background and touch on how officers can fulfill their duties with empathy towards the community in which they serve.

- **Recommendation 27:** Expand or modify the history of policing material to include a broader historical perspective.

- **Recommendation 28:** Integrate into each training module the impact of implicit and/or explicit bias, including racism, and strategies for officers to use in recognizing and mitigating their own biases.

January 28, 2020

- **Recommendation 29:** Integrate into each training module the impact of cultural competence and strategies for officers to use to ensure the equitable treatment of persons regardless of background.

- **Recommendation 30:** Training sessions on bias and cultural competence should define such terms as racism, bigotry, prejudice, xenophobia, homophobia, etc., while also explaining the damaging effects that racism has on the community when used in law enforcement.

Training

- **Recommendation 31:** The Mayor in conjunction with other major municipalities should work in collaboration to tailor Ohio Police Officer Training Academy ("OPOTA") training requirements to the size and function of the law enforcement agency.
    - Create flexibility in the training curriculum required, based on size of law enforcement agency and type of municipality.
    - Limit the 125 hours on traffic instruction to the state highway patrol, and reduce the amount of traffic instruction for municipal jurisdiction officers.
    - Create field training standards.
    - Make the "Blue Courage" training an advanced officer training, not a recruit training.
    - Reduce the number of hours that city officers must complete on RADAR and LIDAR training.
    - Reduce the number of hours that municipal jurisdiction police officers spend on crime scene investigation and convert the remaining hours for advanced officer training for those working towards becoming a detective.
    - Permit local departments to determine the ordering of the curriculum.

- **Recommendation 32:** Include training that addresses officer burn-out/secondary trauma and coping mechanisms.

- **Recommendation 33:** Expand the pool of trainers to include subject-matter - expert civilian instructors who work in the disciplines being taught or trained on.

Hiring

- **Recommendation 34:** Provide opportunities for mentors during the training academy and first 3 years of service, especially for women, minorities and LGBTQIA+.

- **Recommendation 35:** Stop the practice of using credit scores to screen prospective recruits.

- **Recommendation 36:** Increase the probationary period for new recruits by starting the period later in the process, preferably upon Academy graduation.

Diversity and Inclusion

- **Recommendation 37:** Require a signed Morality Clause for all officers that requires officers to agree to equal protection for all citizens, to denounce any cultural supremacist groups, and to report any officer's malfeasance to Internal Affairs.

- **Recommendation 38:** Create the position Officer of Diversity and Inclusion for CDP.

- **Recommendation 39:** Continue to allow all EEO/Sexual Harassment complaints to choose whether to file with Internal Affairs, Department of Public Safety Assistant Director of EEO office, or City Department of Human Resources Equal Employment Opportunity.

- **Recommendation 40:** In addition to the Chief of Police, ownership and accountability of the hiring and training process assigned to a Deputy Chief who shall be responsible for diversity outcomes. Such outcomes tied to a performance evaluation and reported in annual report to include indices on women, racial and ethnic minorities, LGBTQIA+.

Community Engagement

- **Recommendation 41:** CDP should establish a calendar of regularly scheduled, community-based listening sessions in easily accessible locations across the city.

- **Recommendation 42:** CDP should encourage community service in communities where officers serve.

- **Recommendation 43:** CDP should collaborate with institutions of higher education to develop training, analyze data, and evaluate policies that are implemented by the Division.

- **Recommendation 44:** CDP should create a Community Affairs/Relations Bureau ("CAB") to establish, strengthen, and sustain community relationships and trust.

- **Recommendation 45:** Convert the Diversity and Inclusion Liaison Officer positions into full-time positions that are housed in a dedicated unit.

- **Recommendation 46:** Create a Youth Services unit.

- **Recommendation 47:** Evaluate community engagement efforts for efficacy.

- **Recommendation 48:** Implement an annual public survey of the community's opinion toward the police.

Intervention Specialists

- **Recommendation 49:** CDP should collaborate with community-based intervention specialists on crime trends, crime reduction strategies, and intervention services.

- **Recommendation 50:** Intervention specialists should attend roll call to introduce themselves, provide an overview of programs, and explain scope of services.

- **Recommendation 51:** Scope of services by intervention specialists should be integrated as a learning module into the Training Academy.

Crisis Intervention Team

- **Recommendation 52:** CDP should offer annual in-service Crisis Intervention Team ("CIT") training and all CIT officers shall be required to take the course.

- **Recommendation 53:** CIT training should include specific modules to address opioid and mental health resources.

- **Recommendation 54:** CIT in-service training should include a minimum of 8 hours of content.

- **Recommendation 55:** CDP dispatchers should receive the 40-hour CIT training.

- **Recommendation 56:** CDP should maintain the Mobile Crisis Response Team.

- **Recommendation 57:** The Mobile Crisis Response Teams should be able to provide coverage for all shifts.

IT Structure and Data Systems

- **Recommendation 58:** Invest in virtual reality software to train officers.

- **Recommendation 59:** Streamline officer-facing systems and software to maximize interoperability and officer productivity.

- **Recommendation 60:** Create a position to manage and oversee CDP digital assets.

January 28, 2020

- **Recommendation 61:** Create a comprehensive list of applications and databases in use and update list.

- **Recommendation 62:** Future technology investments should be evaluated explicitly for interoperability with existing systems.

- **Recommendation 63:** Implement a comprehensive technology replacement and upgrade plan for IT assets.

Early Warning and Officer Wellness

- **Recommendation 64:** The City should incentivize an annual officer wellness assessment.

- **Recommendation 65:** The Employee Action Review System ("EARS") must be overhauled to incorporate additional sources of information/data and to analyze patterns in real time instead of retrospectively.

- **Recommendation 66:** Implement an annual survey of rank-and-file officers to evaluate officer well-being, job satisfaction, and workplace environment.

- **Recommendation 67:** Implement annual survey of rank-and-file officers to evaluate policing strategies in terms of enhancing or hurting officer ability to connect with the community.

Labor Relations

- **Recommendation 68:** Terminate the leave forfeiture option allowing officers to claim up to 120 hours of accrued sick time for suspensions resulting from corrective/disciplinary action.

- **Recommendation 69:** Amend the length of time an officer's written reprimand for excessive use of force can be removed from a personnel file from 3 years to the duration of employment with CDP.

Independent Investigations

- **Recommendation 70:** Establish an independent civilian review board. We understand this recommendation to be extremely complex and requires time to research, benchmark and review by the City of Columbus elected officials, leadership of Public Safety, the Chief of Police and FOP leadership. Progress on the pursuit of this recommendation is to be reported in the CDP annual report. A diverse work group comprised of internal and external

stakeholders should be established within a year of the installation of the permanent Chief of Police.

- **Recommendation 71:** Amend City Charter to create a city-funded, operationally-independent, professionally-staffed, public-facing entity empowered to participate fully in criminal or administrative investigations involving CDP personnel.

- **Recommendation 72:** Implement a process for independent investigation of 1) officer use of force, including but not limited to, officer use of force resulting in death, officer involved shootings, and in-custody injuries and deaths; and 2) complaints about serious Columbus Division of Police officer misconduct.

Miscellaneous

- **Recommendation 73:** Adopt a specific youth policy to ensure officers respond appropriately to youth in a way that promotes youth and public safety.

- **Recommendation 74:** CDP officers should be subject to mandatory, post-incident drug and alcohol testing immediately following an officer involved shooting or a deadly use of force incident. The policy should include the following requirements: 1) Every officer involved in an officer-involved shooting or a deadly use of force incident must submit to drug and alcohol testing, and 2) the drug and alcohol testing must be completed no later than the end of the involved officer's shift.

- **Recommendation 75:** Implement a residency incentive program for CDP employees.

- **Recommendation 76:** The city should have an internal whistleblower "hotline" or access-point that can allow anonymous submissions from officers of abuse, racism, harassment, etc. Much like the new Columbus Police App that allows for anonymous officer misconduct, but designed for internal review specifically by and directly to the Chief's Office.

- **Recommendation 77:** CDP should add an additional property room in a central location.

- **Recommendation 78:** To better evaluate deployment methods and strategic initiatives (i.e., Safe Streets), data analysts should be trained in modern evaluation techniques and such techniques should be applied consistently to all Division initiatives and programs.

- **Recommendation 79:** Update the uniform standards to allow for culturally-specific head coverings.

- **Recommendation 80:** The Mayor is encouraged to work with city officials, prosecutors, and or the Ohio legislature to eliminate the use of the felony murder statute.

The Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission Report ("Report") was developed after the Commission approved final recommendations on October 22, 2019. Staff circulated a draft for Commissioner review on January 17, 2020. The Report was approved via electronic vote by Commissioners on January 28, 2020 and was publicly released on January 30, 2020.

Bryan M. Clark, Chief Policy Advisor, and Adam S. Friedman, Esq., Senior Policy Advisor, in the Office of Mayor Andrew J. Ginther, developed the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission Report based on information provided to the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission.

The policies and views contained herein are of the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission and of the Commissioners in their private capacities. Commissioners served on a voluntary basis. Staff provided administrative, policy, and informational support throughout the Commission process at the request of Chair Jackson and under the direction of the staff person's appointing authority.

This page is intentionally blank.

RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE COLUMBUS COMMUNITY SAFETY ADVISORY COMMISSION TO MAYOR ANDREW J. GINTHER

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

Recommendations from the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission
To Mayor Andrew J. Ginther

Developed over the course of 24 meetings and analyzed within four subcommittees, the following recommendations represent the culmination of the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission's work since April 2018. Each recommendation was adopted at a public meeting by a majority vote of Commissioners present. Each recommendation is summarized below the motion and includes discussion or background as presented by the Commissioners. City staff compiled, edited, and submitted the draft final report, which was approved by a majority of Commissioners via electronic vote on January 28, 2020. The Final Report was publically released on January 30, 2020.

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

THE FUTURE OF THE COLUMBUS
COMMUNITY SAFETY ADVISORY COMMISSION

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

The Future of the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission

Recommendation 1: Continue the Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission ("CCSAC")
Adopted by a vote of 12 Yes, 1 No, 2 Abstain, 2 Absent

The Commission should continue in some form to help provide oversight of implementation of the recommendations herein. Without continued formal community engagement and oversight, the research and efforts to compile recommendations to improve CDP services and improve the relationship between the community and the CDP may not come to full completion.

Recommendation 2: The CDP should track all Commission-approved recommendations in the CDP annual report as an Annex/Appendix/Attachment. This would provide for updates to the recommendations, available to the public. This would also create a level of accountability for all recommendation status, whether adopted by CDP or not, and create a document that allows for future leadership in an annual report format.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

This recommendation is separate and distinct from continuation of the CCSAC. To ensure public accountability, oversight and input, CDP should report on what recommendations have been enacted, why, and in what manner. This should be part of a larger accountability report that captures all recommendations for change, such as the Matrix Consulting Operations Review of CDP released in 2019 and the Police Executive Research Forum's Review of the Internal Affairs Bureau ("PERF IAB"), and their dispositions. Please see the Appendix for further documentary support.

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

RECRUITMENT

This page is intentionally blank.

Recruitment

Recommendation 3: The CDP Recruitment Unit shall be reassigned to the Human Resources Bureau with no patrol responsibilities.
Adopted by a vote of 12 Yes, 0 No, 3 Abstain, 2 Absent

Reassigning the Recruitment Unit to the Human Resources Bureau will better align the mission and function of recruitment with overall personnel development within the Division.

Recruiting should be a full-time position without other patrol or Division obligations. These professional positions require knowledge of marketing, human resources, and similar fields of expertise; familiarity and ease of interaction with the entire Columbus community; specific training in applicable federal and state laws; unwavering commitment to the City's diversity and inclusion goals; and focus on the mission of marketing CDP to the community.

The Commission recommends that Human Resources provides strong organizational support and context for a more professional, better funded, proactive recruitment unit for the Division.

Recommendation 4: Establish a budget that realistically meets the needs for resources, Recruitment Unit personnel and related resource costs.
Adopted by a vote of 10 Yes, 1 No, 4 Abstain, 2 Absent

The Recruitment Unit requires the staffing and training to properly implement CDP recruitment goals and strategies. Mayor Andrew J. Ginther is to be commended for charging the Director of Public Safety with doubling the number of female and minority members of CDP in the next decade. To achieve that ambitious goal, the Recruitment Unit requires significant new resources, which should be recommended to the Mayor by the Safety Director, Chief of Police, and Department of Finance and Management.

Based on commission research, the current staffing and deployment model for CDP recruitment would benefit from additional resources and realignment. The Hiring Subcommittee compared the size of police departments and recruitment divisions within cities of comparable population size to the City of Columbus. The cities below represent cities comparable to Columbus. The data was obtained from publicly available documents and information provided by the departments.

City	Population	Police Personnel	Civilian Personnel	Total Personnel	Recruitment Officers
Columbus	902,674	1963	367	2330	6
Charlotte	856,062	1,972	520	2,492	15
Denver	619,968	1,518	319	1,837	NA
Indianapolis	872,680	1,700	250	1,950	4
Austin	950,715	2,646	NA	NA	20

Recommendation 5: Add civilian liaisons within recruiting division to New American and minority communities.

Adopted by a vote of 12 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 4 Absent

"Having a department that reflects the community it serves helps to build community trust and confidence, offers operational advantages, improves understanding and responsiveness, and reduces perceptions of bias," according to the 2007 report, "A Symbol of Fairness and Neutrality: Policing Diverse Communities in the 21st Century."[1] By including specific liaisons to persons traditionally underrepresented in the ranks of CDP, the Recruitment Unit may better implement City diversity and inclusion goals for new recruits.

Recommendation 6: Benchmark size of CDP recruiting staff/resources against comparable cities.

Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

See discussion for Recommendation 4.

Recommendation 7: Make recruiting materials available in multiple languages.

Adopted by a vote of 12 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 4 Absent

Effective diversity and inclusion plans include intentional outreach to Columbus' New American residents. Recruitment efforts with these communities will benefit from inclusion of other languages commonly spoken by City residents.

Recommendation 8: Add a referral incentive to include underrepresented minorities with an intentional effort to recruit successful candidates who meet the hiring standards.

Adopted by a vote of 12 Yes, 1 No, 2 Abstain, 2 Absent

The ranks of CDP should reflect, to the greatest extent possible, the communities which safety officers serve and protect. Women, people of color, LGBTQIA+ persons, and other minority groups have been traditionally underrepresented in CDP. Inclusion of these diverse groups will strengthen and legitimize the safety efforts of our Division. By serving with officers who mirror our city's diversity, training in implicit bias and cultural competency will be reinforced in ways that cannot otherwise be replicated.

To achieve these goals, CDP must invest in the recruitment and retention of diverse candidates. The Commission encourages CDP leadership to research national best practices in the area of recruitment and referral incentives – both monetary and nonmonetary – focusing on programs that demonstrate, or are likely to demonstrate, promise in achieving diversity and inclusion goals.

---

[1] International Association of Chiefs of Police. *A Symbol of Fairness and Neutrality: Policing Diverse Communities in the 21st Century.* https://www.scribd.com/document/22576288/International-Association-of-Chiefs-of-Police-IACP-Policing-Diverse-Communities-in-the-21st-Century-July-2007 accessed 12/01/2019.

Recommendation 9: Connect better pipeline for CDP recruitment and Explorer's program with CSCC or other Career Technical Education programs.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

To meet the goal of recruiting police officers who reflect our city's diversity, CDP recruitment efforts should enhance outreach to pipelines that have not been traditionally focused on by the City. Like many employers who receive far more applicants than available positions, the City of Columbus may easily fall into a reactive, rather than proactive, recruitment posture. Intentional focus on expanded, proactive recruitment requires new pipelines and partnerships. Examples include community colleges, career technical education in city schools, and similar educational programs and entities.

The Commission encourages CDP leadership to utilize this recommendation as a springboard for innovative linkages between educational programs that, while not specific to criminal justice, provide a diversity of experience and educational attainment for future recruit classes.

Recommendation 10: Co-recruit/referral to civilian jobs within the City if a potential recruit is not yet of age or fitness level.
Adopted by a vote of 13 Yes, 1 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

Because persons may not become a police officer until age 21, many otherwise interested and qualified applicants may benefit from public service experience prior to applying to become a police officer. A cross functional approach to recruitment would benefit CDP and other City offices, divisions and departments.

Recommendation 11: Establish a case management process to assign applicants to a specific point of contact who remains consistent throughout each step.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

Incorporating a case management model highlighting the individual applicant by monitoring each step in the process is highly recommended. This process would give applicants a consistent point of contact if they have a question about where they are and what the process will be going forward.

One crucial impetus for this recommendation, in addition to assistance for applicants, is the need to better identify and meticulously scrutinize applicant qualification and disqualification at every decision point in the hiring process. While metrics can provide quantitative data for analysis, a case management system would be one way to provide qualitative data for Civil Service and Safety. In this system, monitoring begins at the point of initial interest and continues until an applicant completes field officer training. This highlights that recruitment and selection does not end until an officer has completed his or her probationary employment period satisfactorily.

The Commission is not prescriptive regarding implementation of this recommendation, in part due to the resource requirements for managing over 2,000 potential applicants during each application period.

January 28, 2020

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

Testing

Recommendation 12: Submit all testing materials for a third-party cultural relevancy and implicit bias review.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Intentional or unintentional bias in Civil Service testing materials causes a cascade effect for diversity and inclusion in hiring. As a matter of best practice, all testing materials should be periodically reviewed by a neutral, third party expert for cultural relevancy and implicit bias. The review should align testing with essential qualification points that do not adversely impact a prospective recruit based on a protected status, defined in Columbus City Charter Section 238 as, "…race, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity or expression, color, religion, ancestry, national origin, age, disability, family or military status, or any other status that is protected by federal, state, or local law or ordinance."

Recommendation 13: There should be an independent audit of recruiting/testing process included in an annual report.
Adopted by a vote of 11 Yes, 2 No, 2 Abstain, 2 Absent

The hiring process should be audited on a periodic basis, with results documented in an annual report. Based on research by the Recruitment Subcommittee, the following questions would be especially relevant to such an audit:

- Has the department conducted cultural assessment and evaluation?
- What does quantitative research identify as pivot points for increasing or decreasing diversity in the recruitment and hiring process?
- What impact does an annual civil service test have on the ability to recruit and retain applicants? Would more frequent or rolling testing improve outcomes?
- Should the hiring process be expedited to lessen the time between application and entrance into the Academy?
- Are technologies appropriate for their intended purpose? For example, multiple academic sources question the use of polygraphs, especially since more effective alternatives exist.
- Are subjective hiring practices leading to biased outcomes? If so, how should those practices be changed or eliminated?
- Are staff at every level of the hiring process properly trained and certified?
- Are hiring practices and processes duplicative and, if so, what practice best tests an applicant's fitness for service in the manner least likely to introduce bias into the system?
- Is the hiring process recruiting and producing future officers that reflect the vision and values of the communities served by CDP?
- Is there a rational relationship between disqualifiers and future performance?
- To what extent would a current police officer be disciplined or terminated if she exhibited the same conduct or behavior as those used to disqualify an applicant?
- Do applicants clearly understand why they were disqualified?

- Is the hiring process conducted in the correct order?

Recommendation 14: Add bonus points for successful alumni of Explorers and Cadet programs and current civilian City employees.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

Public Safety Cadets ("PSC") is a worksite-based program for young men and women who have completed the eighth grade and are between 14 - 21 years of age. PSC provides knowledge, skills, and practical experience through education and training delivered by public safety professionals. These mentors help build character, emphasize physical fitness, and instill respect for our community, the rule of law and civil rights. For the young men and women who are interested in a law enforcement career, PSC offers experiential learning with activities that promote the growth and development of young adults.

To increase the value of these programs, the Commission encourages a Columbus City Charter amendment to assign bonus points or similar advantages for successful alumni applying to become Columbus police officers.

Recommendation 15: Add points for additional language fluency/competency/skill set on testing.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

To achieve true representation of our city on the police force, language fluency beyond English should be incentivized. While a charter amendment would be required to award non-skill-based points for language fluency, the Civil Service Commission could identify a standard test for all applicants to assess language fluency and provide points for those who demonstrate such skills. These points would be available for any applicant, rather than being considered stand-alone bonus points similar to the current incentive for US veterans.

Recommendation 16: Provide cultural competency training for those scoring the Columbus Oral Police Exam ("COPE").
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

Providing cultural awareness and implicit bias training for review board panel members demonstrates CDP's commitment to diversity to both the community and the recruit. By equipping all COPE members with the cultural context for applicants, especially in light of the subjective nature of the review, members are better able to fairly and equitably assess potential officers during the COPE process.

Recommendation 17: Maintain trained community members on COPE panel.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

The composition of the oral interview board is important to an effective selection system conducive to workforce diversity. The oral board is one of the most visible aspects of the selection

process, and if the oral board is not well-conducted, candidates feel they did not get a fair chance. Oral interview board participation is one of the most visible forms of community inclusion in the selection process. This community engagement would validate CDP's commitment to the importance of selecting the right candidates to become police officers. It also demonstrates to the candidate the importance of the community to CDP early on in his or her career.

Training for oral review board members should cover legal issues governing inconsistency, irrelevance, subjectivity, and job relevance to avoid inappropriate, discriminatory, or illegal lines of questioning. CDP should ensure that participants are well-trained, demonstrate competencies for the position and apply the same standards to evaluate all candidates. Participants should be briefed on interview etiquette and protocol and given a list of acceptable answers to the prepared questions. It is equally important to supply panel members with a list of questions not to ask, such as questions about health and medical history.

Recommendation 18: Improve COPE scenario designs to bring out problematic bias.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

The Commission engaged in discussion about the impacts of unaddressed implicit bias on just, equitable safety services for our city. Often overlooked are explicit or conscious bias on the part of potential city employees. It is critical that the COPE process include scenarios to bring to light explicit, conscious bias as a basis for potential disqualification of an applicant. For example, if an applicant knowingly engages in bias against persons based on sexual identity or expression, that person could not be entrusted to serve and protect LGBTQIA+ members of the community and should not be admitted to the Academy.

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

This page is intentionally blank.

Curriculum

Recommendation 19: The CDP Training Academy should add and integrate specific language into training curriculum regarding crowd control that specifically addresses citizen's individual civil rights, including first amendment rights and the right to protest, specifically relating to non-aggressive police tactics for non-violent protests/marches. This should also include the opportunities created to increase city/citizen engagement while allowing police to protect rather than using unnecessary violent tactics during non-violent situations.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 2 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Commission makes this recommendation based on testimony from some community members during three public forums. Community members raised questions about the decision-making process and rationale for varying responses, including uses of force, during protest events. These individuals also allege CDP response to protests depends on the nature of the protest itself, with those protests against police use of force receiving a more negative reaction than protests where police officers are perceived to agree with those protesting.

The Commission also notes that Matrix Consulting found CDP's use of force policy to be out of step with best practices for the level of resistance at which chemical agents, such as mace, may be deployed during a protest, and strongly recommends CDP leadership amend the policy in compliance with the best practices identified by Matrix Consulting.

Recommendation 20: The CDP Training Academy should add and integrate specific language into training curriculum regarding access to language services. This should also be a refresher training required for all officers.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 2 Abstain, 1 Absent

To better serve New American and immigrant communities, police officers need quick, consistent access to language translation services. They also need to know exactly how to access these services during an interaction with a non-English-speaking person.

Recommendation 21: Expand the CDP Training Academy juvenile justice training to include adolescent brain development, impact of trauma on the child brain, and why those topics are relevant to policing.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Juvenile Justice module in the CDP curriculum focuses solely on U.S. Supreme Court jurisprudence on how to properly effect juvenile arrest, search and seizure, and interrogation. While necessary, this does not cover the vital topic of normative adolescent brain development and how that impacts youth and police interaction. The full Commission received a presentation

about why children are different from adults and how the underlying science that has driven the holdings in those U.S. Supreme Court decisions is informing policy in other police departments.[2]

The Commission recommends that the juvenile justice training be expanded to include adolescent brain development, the impact of trauma on the child brain,[3] and why those topics are relevant to policing.

Further, officers should be trained on how to modify their behaviors to help de-escalate a situation with youth/teens, as the same tactics that are employed with adults often do not work with children or are expressly harmful to children. The Commission recommends that this module include a civilian expert in the area of normative childhood development and adolescent brain development. And, the Commission recommends that the CDP adopt a specific youth policy to ensure that officers respond appropriately to youth in a way that promotes youth and public safety.[4]

Recommendation 22: Officers should be trained on how to modify behavior to de-escalate situations with youth.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

See discussion for Recommendation 21.

Recommendation 23: In developing and delivering training, include a civilian expert in the area of normative childhood development and adolescent brain development.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

See discussion for Recommendation 21.

Recommendation 24: Expand or modify the cultural competence [training] material to include cultural awareness training germane to the diverse residents/communities currently residing in the city of Columbus.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

See discussion for Recommendation 21.

Recommendation 25: Ensure that training materials, including videos, pictures, and PowerPoints, are inclusive, and not racially or culturally biased or triggering.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

---

[2] See, National Research Council. 2013. *Reforming Juvenile Justice: A Developmental Approach.* Washington, D.C.: The National Academic Press. https://doi.org/10.17226/14685

[3] S.P. Becker & P.K. Kerig, *Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms are Associated with the Frequency and Severity of Delinquency Among Detained Boys*, 40 J. of Clinical Child & Adolescent Psychol. 765 (2011).

[4] Suggested resources for this type of policy or program can be found at: http://strategiesforyouth.org/for-police/training/ (Policing the Teen Brain report); and, the CDP's TAPS curriculum could also be used and given to a broader swath of cadets/officers.

All curriculum must be reviewed to ensure that materials do not reinforce bias or negative cultural stereotyping.

For example, the current active shooter training module highlighted two specific instances of active shooters/terrorism that were tied to Muslim perpetrators. Yet, there are other real-life examples of mass shootings, bombings, and terrorist events that involve perpetrators of other races, ethnicities, religious backgrounds and national origin that could have been used instead or along with those examples.

Similarly, photos of protests used in a presentation and featured primarily non-white protestors, which does not match the demographic of protests that have occurred in Columbus in recent years.

Although it may not be intentional, failure to diversify examples and sample scenarios can reinforce negative stereotypes in the mind of the learner (i.e., only seeing African American men labeled "bad guy" in a video or training can unintentionally communicate that African American men are the "bad guys" in real life). These can also cause officers to miscalculate the threat posed by those who are primarily presented in a positive role.

Recommendation 26: Training materials should include officers of a racially/ethnically diverse background and touch on how officers can fulfill their duties with empathy towards the community in which they serve.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Just as materials should not create or reinforce stereotypes or bias – positive or negative – the officers depicted in materials should mirror the diversity of our city. By depicting diverse, inclusive police officers in a positive, community-minded manner, materials can reinforce the City's commitment to just, equitable safety services and support a tolerant, inclusive culture within CDP.

Recommendation 27: Expand or modify the history of policing material to include a broader historical perspective.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

The ABC's of Policing training module includes the history of policing in Ohio and Columbus, but it does not detail the history of policing in America as it relates to slavery, Jim Crow, segregation, the 13th Amendment, civil rights, and so forth. Nor does it touch on the cultural context of policing in the countries of origin for New Americans in Columbus.

The Commission recommends that a more broadly-inclusive history of policing is adopted, to educate recruits on the roots of policing. This will not only provide officers with a proper historical perspective but will also provide a factual, rather than subjective, context for why some members

of the community have a negative perception of law enforcement and how that may impact the community's responsiveness to engagement with law enforcement.

Recommendation 28: Integrate into each training module the impact of implicit and/or explicit bias, including racism, and strategies for officers to use in recognizing and mitigating their own biases.[5]
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Like most current Columbus Police Training Academy modules, trainings on bias and cultural competence are delivered as discrete blocks or modules, rather than subjects integrated throughout the training experience. As such, the various training modules that would benefit from a bias and cultural competence dimension currently lack any substantive reference to those issues.

For example, in the trainings on tactics, deadly force, subject control, use of force, de-escalation, and crisis intervention, there is no mention of the need to be aware of how bias may impact an officer's decision-making or how cultural competence is a necessary component to ensuring safe outcomes in those circumstances. To ensure that recruits understand how their perceptions of what force is necessary are impacted by their own biases, it is critical to include in those modules the impact of bias and the need for cultural competence. Incorporating this material across modules will reinforce the idea of measured, fair, and appropriate levels of force, based on culturally competent perceptions. This will allow recruits to still be taught the skills they need for de-escalation and use of force, which promotes public safety.

To make sure the material adequately addresses explicit bias, the sessions on bias and cultural competence should also define such terms as bias, prejudice, and protected classes, while also explaining the damaging effects that officer-involved bias and prejudice have on the community.

This integrated approach to training will ensure that cultural competence and the impact of bias is integrated into the culture of the CDP.

Recommendation 29: Integrate into each training module the impact of cultural competence and strategies for officers to use to ensure the equitable treatment of persons regardless of background.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

See discussion under Recommendation 28.

---

[5] Devine, P.G., Forscher, P.S., Austin, A.J., & Cox, W.T. (2012). Long-term reduction in implicit bias: A prejudice habit-breaking intervention. Journal of Experimental Psychology, 1267-1278.

Recommendation 30: Training sessions on bias and cultural competence should define such terms as racism, bigotry, prejudice, xenophobia, homophobia, etc., while also explaining the damaging effects that racism has on the community when used in law enforcement.

Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

See discussion under Recommendation 28.

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

TRAINING

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

Training

Recommendation 31: The Mayor in conjunction with other major municipalities should work in collaboration to tailor Ohio Police Officer Training Academy ("OPOTA") training requirements to the size and function of the law enforcement agency.

> a. Create flexibility in the training curriculum required, based on size of law enforcement agency and type of municipality.
> b. Limit the 125 hours on traffic instruction to the state highway patrol, and reduce the amount of traffic instruction for municipal jurisdiction officers.
> c. Create field training standards.
> d. Make the "Blue Courage" training an advanced officer training, not a recruit training.
> e. Reduce the number of hours that city officers must complete on RADAR and LIDAR training.
> f. Reduce the number of hours that municipal jurisdiction police officers spend on crime scene investigation and convert the remaining hours for advanced officer training for those working towards becoming a detective.
> g. Permit local departments to determine the ordering of the curriculum.

Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Ohio Peace Officer Training Commission ("OPOTC") consists of ten members appointed by the governor with advice and consent of the senate. As prerequisites for admission into the Basic Peace Officer training program, admission and training standards have been established by the OPOTC. The Commission does not recommend that the Mayor disregard established laws, but the Commission does recommend that that a discussion happen so OPOTA training requirements can be tailored to the size and function of a law enforcement agency. The Mayor should approach this effort by engaging with leaders from other large municipalities in a spirt of collaboration. The Commission believes that if Recommendation 31 is completed, sub points a-g have the possibility of being completed. To affect most of the other changes, something has to give with the OPOTA hours. The value of having sub points is to show how much time is actually spent on these training areas where Police Divisions' needs are actually different than what OPOTA requires.

Blue Courage is a two-day training course to educate officers on principles and practices of human effectiveness, purpose driven work, resilience, positive attitude, and sound judgment.

Recommendation 32: Include training that addresses officer burn-out/secondary trauma and coping mechanisms.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

In any given shift, an officer can go from responding to a domestic violence case or homicide to a noise ordinance violation—without any space to process the differences in those scenarios. The theme of how much stress an officer takes on day-to-day is threaded throughout officer training; but, the curriculum does not provide a lot of resources or training for how to recognize the fatigue that accompanies this type of secondary trauma or how to cope with it. Given the risk that this

poses to officer health and community safety, integrating a training module that focuses on this and reiterates its usage is important.

Recommendation 33: Expand the pool of trainers to include subject-matter expert civilian instructors who work in the disciplines being taught or trained on.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Each training module has a group of subject matter experts listed in the materials. It appears that those experts were contributors to the materials and/or instructors. Most of the experts listed are law enforcement or attorneys from the Attorney General and City Attorney's Office. In discussions with Training Bureau personnel, it was determined that there are only a few subject matter experts from other disciplines, and they appear in only two of the topics taught during the academy.

However, presentations to the Commission variously describe the role of the police officer as crime fighter, service provider, community liaison, conflict resolution specialist, and mental health worker. Fulfilling these roles requires officers to possess the necessary cultural competency and emotional intelligence to deal with critical incidents and tragedies in the context of the communities and persons involved.

Given the wide range of expectations facing officers, it would only make sense to draw on a wide range of subject matter experts to teach these critical skills. It should also be self-evident that these are skills – not innate traits – and should be taught with equal, or greater, importance to traditional criminal justice topics.

The Commission thus recommends that subject matter experts be expanded to include additional instructors who work in the disciplines being taught. For example, one curriculum-specific recommendation is that the juvenile justice training module be revamped to focus on normative adolescent development and best practices in police and youth engagement. Supplementing the subject matter experts/trainers with a professional who works in this area (i.e., a child psychologist or pediatrician) will ensure that best practices for understanding, responding, and promoting good outcomes with youth and teens are included; that research is updated; and that trainees know more than simply what is necessary to effect lawful stops, searches and arrests.[6]

---

[6] Potential Resources: Columbus Community Relations Commission, http://columbus.gov/crc/ ; Kirwan Institute for the Study of Race and Ethnicity, www.kirwaninstitute.osu.edu ; The Ohio State University ADVANCE Workshops, www.advance.edu/initiatives

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

Hiring

Recommendation 34: Provide opportunities for mentors during the training academy and first 3 years of service, especially for women, minorities and LGBTQIA+.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Establishment of affinity groups (also known as employee resource groups), formal mentoring structures, and associated employee services are common across industries in the private and, to a lesser extent, public sectors. However, such systems are voluntary and informal at CDP. Research shows that these systems lead to more energized, engaged, and successful employees.[7]

The Commission recommends CDP support and foster opportunities for formal mentorship at the beginning of an officer's training through the first three years of service. Special focus should be provided for groups that are historically underrepresented in the ranks of CDP.

Recommendation 35: Stop the practice of using credit scores to screen prospective recruits.
Adopted by a vote of 13 Yes, 0 No, 2 Abstain, 2 Absent

Despite the potential for disqualification due to a low credit score, CDP did not present evidence of a correlation between a police officer's effective service and that officer's credit score. Further, an officer would face no negative impact – nor would CDP have reason to know about a low credit score – once on the force.

Ample evidence shows that measures such as credit scores are proxies for socioeconomic status, not likelihood of success in a given profession.[8] As such, inclusion of this measure equate to inclusion of an unnecessarily discriminatory measure with little value to the evaluation of an applicant.

Recommendation 36: Increase the probationary period for new recruits by starting the period later in the process, preferably upon Academy graduation.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

It is clear that CDP has one of the most extensive and professional officer training programs in Ohio, if not the nation. Nevertheless, it could be improved further. Under the current system, the division remains too rigidly constrained by the 12-month probationary deadline. This limits the topics that can be covered during the fixed number of training hours, the depth of that coverage, and the sequencing and timing of training.

---

[7] https://ceo.usc.edu/files/2016/10/2013-07-G13-07-626-Making_Business_Case_for_Emp_Resource.pdf accessed 12/01/2019.
[8] https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2015/oct/13/your-credit-score-is-racist-heres-why accessed 12/01/2019.

In addition, while it is important that the tactical and scenario-based training be completed before recruits begin their field training, many of the advanced training topics — especially those related to police-community relations — are best saved until officers have some street experiences and have had a chance to be involved in police-community interactions first-hand. Recruits are unlikely to appreciate the importance of these issues before spending some time working on the street.

Extending the probationary period will also allow some of these topics to be revisited after the field training phase has been completed, when the training is likely to do be most useful and the topics least abstract.

This change would also better align the Columbus Division of Police with best practices in other departments nationwide. Based on research by the 21st Century Policing Ssubcommittee, the following table summarizes the probationary period during the academy and post-academy. Of note: Columbus' 12-month probationary period, which begins upon entrance into the Academy, is out of sync with other major police departments across the country.

Department	Probation Before Academy Completion	Probation After Academy Completion
Chicago Police Dept.		X – 13 months
New York Police Dept.	X	X – 18 months
Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Dept.		X – 1 Year
Indianapolis Metropolitan Police Dept.		X
Houston Police Dept.		X – 6 months
Austin Police Dept.		X – 15 months
Detroit Police Dept.	X	X – 12 months (18 months total)
Atlanta Police Dept.		X – 12 weeks

Additionally, the Columbus Police Academy has mandatory topics to be covered in the Ohio Peace Officer Training Commission ("OPOTC") Curriculum in order to certify Peace Officers. As can be seen from the curriculum hours listed below, the mandated hours have increased significantly since 2015. As a result, CDP will not be able to increase the probationary time during which a person is serving as a police officer *and* meet mandatory and best practice training curriculum standards.

January 28, 2020

Curriculum	Date	Mandated hours
BAS-032	7/1/2015	616
BAS-034	1/1/2016	653
BAS-036	1/1/2017	695
BAS-038	1/1/2018	711
BAS-039(039a)	7/1/2018	728
BAS-040	7/1/2019	737

The Commission does not prescribe the specific process or timing of this change. One idea presented is to create an officer-in-training classification until a recruit completes all Academy and field officer trainings. At that point, the recruit would become a police officer, triggering a one year probationary period. Given the immense authority and resources invested in our police officers, such an approach offers obvious advantages, with few trade-offs. The Commission notes that such a change will necessitate an amendment to the Columbus City Charter.

January 28, 2020

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

Diversity and Inclusion

The Commission makes recommendations in this section cognizant of survey results within CDP and the community which document the experience of discrimination and bias by people of color and women. These issues are real and must be addressed clearly, without dissembling or equivocation. Indeed, this may be one of the most important issues to be addressed within the Division.

Recommendation 37: Require a signed Morality Clause for all officers that requires officers to agree to equal protection for all citizens, to denounce any cultural supremacist groups, and to report any officer's malfeasance to Internal Affairs.

Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Many private companies around the world require employees to sign a "morality clause" which is an agreement that they will act within good faith and provide services while in a sober state of mind and for the good of the company.

This should apply to all Columbus police officers upon new hire and for existing officers. This statement is an expansion of the Oath currently required. This clause should include a statement that explicitly requires officers to agree to equal protection to all residents based on the classes protected in the Columbus City Charter Section 238; the denunciation of any cultural supremacist groups; and an affirmative duty to report other officer's malfeasance to the appropriate investigative body.

Recommendation 38: Create the position Officer of Diversity and Inclusion for CDP.

Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 2 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Commission cannot stress enough the importance of a commitment to diversity throughout the leadership of CDP, as well as appointment of a single person solely responsible for driving the Division's diversity and inclusion plans. A clear and unwavering value to the dedication to diversity and inclusion goals is critical to establishing and maintaining a culture that can deliver the 21st Century Policing standards documented throughout our recommendations.

A transparent accountability structure that measures progress and holds individuals responsible for meeting diversity goals must be established. A commitment to diversity must be seen as a long-term sustainable strategic plan, rather than a quick fix.

The Commission recommends the creation of an Office of Diversity and Inclusion for CDP to elevate this critical need within the Division.

Recommendation 39: Continue to allow all EEO/Sexual Harassment complainants to choose whether to file with Internal Affairs, Department of Public Safety Assistant Director of EEO office, or City Department of Human Resources Equal Employment Opportunity.
Adopted by a vote of 13 Yes, 0 No, 3 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Commission commends Mayor Andrew J. Ginther for creating a directors-office-level position to oversee EEO issues within public safety, and for reaffirming the right of employees to choose where they wish to file a complaint. In Columbus, Equal Employment Resource serves as a resource to management and City employees in securing equal employment opportunity for all members of the workforce.[9]

Recommendation 40: In addition to the Chief of Police, ownership and accountability of the hiring and training process assigned to a Deputy Chief who shall be responsible for diversity outcomes. Such outcomes tied to a performance evaluation and reported in annual report to include indices on women, racial and ethnic minorities, LGBTQIA+.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

The Chief of Police must demonstrate a commitment to diversity and inclusion by creating a clearly defined vision establishing a culture of trust, respect and value for every resident and division employee. The Chief and Deputy Chief must be expected to achieve metrics that demonstrate improvement, progress and success in hiring, mentoring and promoting a more diverse workforce.

The Commission's definition of diversity mirrors that of the City Charter, Section 238, as follows: "…race, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity or expression, color, religion, ancestry, national origin, age, disability, family or military status, or any other status that is protected by federal, state, or local law or ordinance."

The plan to attract, increase and retain diverse candidates requires strong CDP leadership and community involvement, working towards a common goal and plan. Once this process is initially complete, CDP leadership must be accountable for the diversity and inclusion plan with measurable goals that are publicly available and benchmarked on at least an annual basis. Strategies to increase diversity must be incorporated into every facet of the division's planning. And CDP leadership's commitment to diversity should consistently appear throughout written documentation, its mission statements, policies, and recruiting material.

---

[9] https://www.columbus.gov/hr/eeo/

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

This page is intentionally blank.

Community Engagement

Recommendation 41: CDP should establish a calendar of regularly scheduled, community-based listening sessions in easily accessible locations across the city.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Currently, there is not a publicized calendar of community engagement events for CDP to proactively engage the community. The existing model is for officers to report their activity to their superior officer, and that information is then compiled into a comprehensive report at the end of the year. Currently, the report is 114 pages long. Although it is good to know that CDP officers are engaged in the community, the perception is that their engagement is often sporadic and scattered.

Creating and then publicizing a calendar of community events would allow the public the opportunity to engage and talk to officers in a non-enforcement environment. Initiatives such as these cultivate trust, build legitimacy, and facilitate better police/community relations.

Recommendation 42: CDP should encourage community service in communities where officers serve.
Adopted by a vote of 11 Yes, 4 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

As part of a larger effort to proactively engage with residents they protect and serve, police officers should be encouraged to find opportunities for community service where they patrol or otherwise serve.

Recommendation 43: CDP should collaborate with institutions of higher education to develop training, analyze data, and evaluate policies that are implemented by the Division.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

According to the Taskforce on 21st Century Policing, it is important that law enforcement agencies identify, operationalize, and embrace best practices as it pertains to public safety and policing. Given the rapidly changing landscape of public safety, including community expectations, shifting crime trends, and evolving technologies, independent, expert assistance with best practices continues to be crucial to the success and legitimacy of public safety efforts in Columbus.

While training is provided through the Columbus Police Academy, in alignment with the OPOTA statewide standards, it is recommended that the Columbus Division of Police be open to collaboration with institutions of higher education that not only specialize in data analysis and evaluation, but also have the capacity and experience to develop teaching and training content that can be presented in alternative formats for online, hybrid, and face-to-face instruction.

Numerous studies show that high quality education and training can contribute to improved police performance through increased expertise, knowledge, initiative, and integrity. This may lead to

improved police/community relations as officers implement best practices in line with community norms and expectations.

Other studies have found that contemporary approaches to police training are essential for law enforcement agencies to develop professionals who are equipped to make good decisions and handle the complex responsibilities required to implement community policing strategies.

Recommendation 44: CDP should create a Community Affairs/Relations Bureau ("CAB") to establish, strengthen, and sustain community relationships and trust.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Although improving police/community relations should be a priority for every officer within the Columbus Division of Police, a Community Affairs Bureau should be established to facilitate ongoing engagement with Columbus communities including, but not limited to, neighborhood and civic associations, faith-based organizations, youth populations, and diverse communities including ethnically and racially diverse groups such as African American, Somali, Latino, and other New Americans, LGBTQIA+, and residents in traumatized and/or highly-policed neighborhoods.

The CAB should oversee functions such as Community Outreach/Liaison, Youth Strategies, and Mounted Patrol. The Commission also recommends the creation of a Youth Strategies unit, which would comprise youth programs including Explorers, Teen and Police Services ("TAPS"), Student Resource Officers ("SROs"), etc. This would allow the department to have a dedicated unit for youth engagement strategies and initiatives. Many major police departments have established CABs that have yielded successful results.

Department	Community Affairs/Relations Unit
Miami (Florida) Police Dept.	X – Community Relations
Atlanta (Georgia) Police Dept.	X – Community Services Division
St. Louis (Missouri) Metropolitan Police Dept.	X – Bureau of Community Policing
Charlotte-Mecklenburg (North Carolina) Police Dept.	X – Community Engagement Division
Cobb County (Georgia) Police Dept.	X
Chicago (Illinois) Police Department	X
Indianapolis (Indiana) Police Department	X – Office of Diversity and Inclusion
New York (New York) Police Department	X
Houston (Texas) Police Dept.	X – Office of Public Affairs
Austin (Texas) Police Dept.	X – Office of Community Liaison
San Francisco (California) Police Dept.	X – Community Engagement Division
Nashville (Tennessee) Police Dept.	X – Community Services Bureau
San Antonio (Texas) Police Dept.	X – Community Engagement and Technology
Seattle (Washington) Police Dept.	X – Micro Community Policing Plans (MCPP)

Recommendation 45: Convert the Diversity and Inclusion Liaison Officer positions into full-time positions that are housed in a dedicated unit.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Community Outreach/Liaison unit should have dedicated, full-time, Diversity and Inclusion Liaison Officers ("DILO") who are responsible for continuous engagement in the community. Although CDP currently has Inclusion Officer Liaisons, these are not full-time positions, nor are they housed within a dedicated unit. This places significant limitations on officers' ability to remain actively engaged in the community. Therefore, the Commission recommends converting the DILO positions into full-time, nonpatrol positions that are housed in a dedicated unit.

Recommendation 46: Create a Youth Services unit.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 2 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Commission recommends the creation of a Youth Services Unit, which could comprise youth programs such as Explorers, Teens and Police Services ("TAPS"), Student Resource Officers ("SROs"), and so forth. This would allow the division to have a dedicated unit for youth engagement strategies and initiatives.

Recommendation 47: Evaluate community engagement efforts for efficacy.
Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain

The Division of Police currently undertakes numerous community engagement efforts. Indeed, the Commission was presented with a spreadsheet listing hundreds of different community engagements and activities CDP utilizes to create positive interactions between the division and the community. These efforts are admirable, but there have been no efforts undertaken to systematically evaluate whether they actually work and have the desired effect. Given the tremendous amount of division resources and officer time spent on engagement, the lack of rigorous evaluation is problematic.

The Commission recommends CDP partner with independent, third-party experts to embed evaluation in community engagement to allow for continuous review of efficacy.

Recommendation 48: Implement an annual public survey of the community's opinion toward the police.
Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain

To understand the efficacy and efficiency of police/community relations, CDP should implement an annual public survey of the community to gauge trends in attitudes towards and expectations of public safety.

Carrying out an annual survey was one of the recommendations made by the President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing. Such survey must be statistically valid using a representative

sample of residents, not an unrepresentative, opt-in, online survey. It would ideally include over-samples in neighborhoods where CDP enforcement activities disproportionately take place.

To the extent possible, the survey should be made available in major languages spoken by a significant number of residents. However, the Commission notes this presents significant cost and logistic challenges in quantitative research instruments, which is why the Matrix Consulting community survey was presented in English. But, as with the Matrix Consulting survey, CDP may augment the statistical survey with community focus groups conducted in those languages.

Finally, sample size must be of sufficient size to produce valid inferences about public opinion. Ideally, such a survey could be paired with an intentional evaluation of outreach activities (e.g., focusing activities in a specific part of the city, to see if opinion in the targeted area improves relative to other neighborhoods that were not the focus of similar engagement efforts).

January 28, 2020

This page is intentionally blank.

Intervention Specialists

Recommendation 49: CDP should collaborate with community-based intervention specialists on crime trends, crime reduction strategies, and intervention services.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

With diminished trust between some communities and the police, in addition to historic and cultural norms that may disapprove of perceived collaboration with law enforcement, residents may be less likely to call the police for assistance when a crime occurs. Intervention specialist may fill this gap in information, providing needed community perspectives to inform crime trends, reduction strategies, and future intervention strategies.

Local intervention specialists may have pertinent knowledge regarding crimes that take place in their respective communities. They could also prove instrumental for preventing retaliatory violence.

By way of reference, intervention strategies through programs such as APPS[10] consist of street-level violence interruption and conflict mediation teamed with case management and support services to address the risk factors that can lead to crime and violence. This is put into practice by intervention specialists that build trusting relationships with young people that are partially responsible for driving the violence in our communities, directing them to healthy alternatives that have redeeming value.

Therefore, it is critical that the Columbus Division of Police collaborate with Intervention Specialists to: 1) understand their scope of services, 2) engage in information sharing to effectively reduce escalations in violence, and 3) use Intervention Specialists to de-escalate situations that can be resolved without the assistance of law enforcement.

There have historically been perceived barriers to organized collaborative efforts between CDP and Intervention Specialists. Some coordination takes place via the Violent Crime Review Group, but this is focused on large-scale crime reduction strategies.

One fruitful example of collaboration may be the partnership between CDP and the CARE Coalition.[11] Part of the Community, Action, Resilience and Empowerment services of the CARE Coalition includes community resource needs assessments and trauma-informed care services after acts of violence in a community. In coordination – but not in tandem – with CDP, CARE Coalition members directly interact with persons impacted by violence. A similar partnership could be utilized for CDP and Intervention Specialists.

---

[10] For more information about APPS, see https://www.columbus.gov/recreationandparks/programs/Applications-for-Purpose,-Pride-and-Success-(APPS)/ accessed 12/01/2019.

[11] For more information about the CARE Coalition, see
https://www.columbus.gov/publichealth/programs/Neighborhood-Services/Community-Resilience-Coalition/
accessed 12/01/2019.

Recommendation 50: Intervention specialists should attend roll call to introduce themselves, provide an overview of programs, and explain scope of services.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

This recommendation is provided as an implementation strategy for Recommendation 49.

Recommendation 51: Scope of services by intervention specialists should be integrated as a learning module into the Training Academy.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

This recommendation is provided as an implementation strategy for Recommendation 49.

January 28, 2020

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

Crisis Intervention Team

Recommendation 52: CDP should offer annual in-service Crisis Intervention Team ("CIT") training and all CIT officers shall be required to take the course.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 1 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Since January of 2017, the Columbus Division of Police's Recruit Training Unit has required all police recruits to complete a 40-hour CIT curriculum which certifies them as a CIT officer. Prior to January of 2017, CIT training was only offered to officers as a component of their Basic Ohio Peace Officer Training Curriculum and did not certify them as a CIT officer. CDP began offering CIT training certification on a voluntary basis in 2002.

Since CIT's inception, the Division has not offered in-service training to all officers on a mandatory basis, despite new de-escalation techniques being available, an increase of Iraq and Afghanistan veterans with PTSD, and the rise of the opioid epidemic. This is problematic for improving police/community relations because the absence of standardized training on crisis response could potentially escalate a situation, lead to a preventable arrest, or result in an unnecessary use of force.

In an attempt to determine the prevalence of CIT in-service training, the Commission reached out to 15 police departments comparable to the size of CDP, and found that a plurality offer it to their officers. The Commission has also found that some departments embrace Mobile Crisis Teams to address situations in which an individual in a mental health crisis may be involved. The Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Standards ("CALEA") program seals are reserved for use by those public safety agencies that have demonstrated compliance with CALEA Standards and have been awarded CALEA Accreditation by the Commission.[12]

---

[12] https://www.calea.org/

City	Total Officers	CALEA Certified	CIT Officers	Mobile Crisis Team	CIT In-Service
Columbus, OH	1,823	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
Atlanta, GA	1,775	Yes	Yes	No	No
Baltimore County	1,870	Yes	Yes	Behavioral Assessment Team	60 Hours Per Year
Baltimore, MD	2,962	No	Yes	No	60 Hours Per Year (Legislative)
Dekalb Co., GA	1,295	Yes	Yes	No	No
Fort Wayne, IN	444	No	Yes	No	Yes
Houston, TX	5,318	No	Yes	Crisis Intervention Response Team	Annual
Indianapolis, IN	1,591	Yes	Yes	No	No
Jacksonville, FL Sheriff's Office	2,255	Yes	Yes	No	No
Memphis, TN	2,409	Yes	Yes	No	Yes
Nashville, TN	1,312	Yes	Yes	No	No
San Antonio, TX	2,276	No	Yes	No	No
San Francisco, CA	2,173	No	Yes	No	No
Seattle, WA Police Department	1,300	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
St. Louis, MO	1,782	Yes	Yes	No	No
West Palm Beach, FL	294	No	Yes	No	Yes

Recommendation 53: CIT training should include specific modules to address opioid and mental health resources.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Commission recommends that the CIT training include specific modules to address opioid and mental health resources. With treatment and the mental health climate constantly changing, it is critical that CDP officers are provided with the most up-to-date information regarding the location and spectrum of services that are provided by organizations across the city.

Recommendation 54: CIT in-service training should include a minimum of 8 hours of content.

Adopted by a vote of 13 Yes, 2 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Commission recommends the initial CIT training include 8 hours of content, as that is the average amount of in-service hours across comparable departments that offer this training. Currently, two hours is not sufficient time for an officer to: 1) learn about types and contexts of crises, including mental illness, and 2) learn how to effectively deal with an individual in a crisis. In fact, the Police Executive Research Forum (PERF) indicated that officers in medium to large departments should receive at least 16 hours of training on crisis response and other mental health topics.

Recommendation 55: CDP dispatchers should receive the 40-hour CIT training.

Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

It has been repeatedly stated that only in the past two years have new dispatchers for the Columbus Division of Police received any training on crisis intervention and/or de-escalation. In addition, the training currently offered is only 8 hours instead of the CIT certification course of 40 hours.

A complete CIT certification for all dispatchers is imperative because: 1) they are often the first to receive calls from residents in crisis, and 2) how they interpret the situation and inform the responding officer will impact how the officer responds to the situation. In other words, the information that is conveyed and how it is conveyed to officers could impact outcomes for the officer, the person in crisis, and innocent bystanders. For some, this could mean the difference between no force and lethal force.

Studies[13] have repeatedly found that in addition to police officers, dispatchers should be prepared to respond to people in crisis. Dispatchers certified in CIT are uniquely prepared to ask specific questions and relay pertinent information to officers. Many departments in places like Houston and Memphis, attribute much of their success in managing those with mental health crisis to the dispatchers who initially take the call.

Recommendation 56: CDP should maintain the Mobile Crisis Response Team.

Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 1 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

CDP began a pilot program in June of 2018 called the Mobile Crisis Response Team. The goal of the team is de-escalation and, when available, solutions at the scene rather than a jail or hospital. The team pairs an officer with a mental health professional, and together they respond to mental health calls for service when people are in crisis. They also follow up on overdoses to ensure all available resources are offered to those in need of addiction services.

---

[13] See https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1350/pojo.2008.81.4.431

These teams are important to patrol officers because a specialized unit is better equipped to handle those in crisis. It also frees patrol officers to be available for other calls for service because mental health runs can be very time consuming.

Recommendation 57: The Mobile Crisis Response Teams should be able to provide coverage for all shifts.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Currently, Mobile Crisis Response Teams are available based on CDP analysis of trends in calls for crisis response. However, teams are not available for every shift, every day. Given the disproportionate likelihood that responding to a crisis call can lead to an adverse outcome for the officer(s), the person, and/or others, these teams should be a core to shift coverage at all times.

IT STRUCTURE AND DATA SYSTEMS

This page is intentionally blank.

IT Structure and Data Systems

Simply put, CDP's current hardware and software systems are inadequate to meet either the Division's or the City's needs. The following examples illustrate common IT issues for the Division:

- The Commission was told that it is currently not possible to export officer attendance records to merge them with the separate database of officer use of force, to incorporate both variables into the EARS process.

- The Commission has also heard anecdotes of officers having to complete reports digitally, then print them out and physically scan them back in and e-mail the documents to themselves as PDFs, to upload the records to the court system, which apparently cannot communicate with CDP's report-writing software.

The number of separate applications that officers must run on their cruiser computers using separate windows is overwhelming.

Technology is used to execute the day-to-day tasks associated with the work of law enforcement. However, the technology used by the Columbus Division of Police has several limitations. Specifically, the computer systems and software used by CDP officers are not integrated which delays data input and makes it difficult for officers to conduct routine tasks. Often, the length of time required for officers to input data due to the disintegrated systems discourages officers from completing reports or minimizes the effectiveness of those reports.

These issues present larger problems for solving crimes, improving public safety, prompting efficient and effective use of staff time, and ensuring officer safety. Through that lens, it becomes clear the critical nature of these recommendations.

The foregoing rationale applies to all recommendations in this section, in addition to recommendation-specific discussions.

Recommendation 58: Invest in virtual reality software to train officers.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

To improve officer training scenarios, the Commission recommends that the Columbus Division of Police invest in virtual reality software to prepare officers to respond appropriately to complex situations. Although speaking about an experience is informative, living the experience in a virtual reality scenario could be life altering, and better train officers.

One study found that while standard training resulted in more motivation among the trainees, virtual training facilitated a learning transfer from the virtual scenario to a real-life scenario.[14]

---

[14] https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S074756321400555X accessed 12/01/2019.

Other studies have found that people are better able to make neural connections in training environments that involve practice, failure, and consequential experiences.[15]

By embracing the concept of immersive learning through virtual reality, officers who participate in the training are better able to translate their experiences to patrol work.

Recommendation 59: Streamline officer-facing systems and software to maximize interoperability and officer productivity.
Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

See discussion under section heading.

Recommendation 60: Create a position to manage and oversee CDP digital assets.
Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

According to the Taskforce on 21st Century Policing, new social media technology has the potential to allow officers the opportunity to better understand community expectations for transparency, accountability, and privacy.

The Police Executive Research Forum ("PERF") and the U.S. Office of Community Oriented Policing Services ("COPS"), surveyed more than 200 police departments and found that many departments use some form of online/social media platform. All departments used an agency website, most departments used some form of social media, and many planned to use social media in the near future.

Social Media Type	Responding Agencies Currently Using	Responding agencies plan to use within 2-5 years
Agency Website	100%	N/A
Facebook	82%	14%
Twitter	69%	18%
YouTube	48%	20%
LinkedIn	34%	20%

The outcomes suggest the benefits of social media span beyond just engaging communities to including enhancement of public safety, improved recruitment, and higher clearance rates for crimes.

---

[15] https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/abstract/document/7786974 accessed 12/012019.

Recommendation 61: Create a comprehensive list of applications and databases in use and update list.

Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

See discussion under section heading.

Recommendation 62: Future technology investments should be evaluated explicitly for interoperability with existing systems.

Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

See discussion under section heading.

Recommendation 63: Implement a comprehensive technology replacement and upgrade plan for IT assets.

Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

See discussion under section heading.

January 28, 2020

This page is intentionally blank.

EARLY WARNING AND OFFICER WELLNESS

This page is intentionally blank.

Early Warning and Officer Wellness

Recommendation 64: The City should incentivize an annual officer wellness assessment.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Officer wellness is a key pillar of 21st Century Policing. Law enforcement takes a physical, mental and emotional toll on employees, regardless of assignment or years of service. By investing in the wellness of its officers, the City of Columbus will better position its Division of Police to implement other 21st Century policing best practices.

There are contractual issues pertaining to mandating all officers to obtain an annual wellness assessment. This mirrors a similar situation when CDP attempted to have officers complete an annual physical fitness assessment and collective bargaining agreement provisions prevented them from doing so. As an alternative, the City of Columbus incentivized officers to stay in shape by providing additional leave or compensation if they complete an annual physical fitness test. Most recent data suggest that nearly 80% of CDP officers now complete the test voluntarily due to the incentives. This model should be replicated for overall officer wellness, including mental health.

Recommendation 65: The Employee Action Review System ("EARS") must be overhauled to incorporate additional sources of information/data and to analyze patterns in real time instead of retrospectively.
Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

An effective "early-warning" system that flags worrying patterns of behavior is considered an essential best practice for law enforcement agencies. While CDP currently purports to have such a system (Employee Action Review System, or EARS), it falls well short of state-of-the-art and has major limitations.

Currently, the EARS committee meets only twice per year, and analyzes historical data on Level 2 through Level 8 uses of force and complaints against officers for investigations that have been completed. While such historical review is an essential part of an early-warning system, a truly effective approach must incorporate real-time data in a proactive, predictive system, rather than a reactive system. Relying on retrospective data to prevent officer misconduct is like trying to drive a car by looking only in the rearview mirror twice a year.

The data currently used by the EARS committee is far from comprehensive. For example, recent research on predicting police officers' "risk of adverse events" uses data from the Charlotte-Mecklenburg Police Department and finds that a number of key variables are important predictors of officer misconduct, including: (1) officer attendance; (2) secondary employment and number of extra duty hours; (3) type and number of recent dispatch events; (4) number of citations issued and traffic stops made; (5) proportion of interactions that were officer-initiated vs. dispatched;

and (6) time and location of officer beat.[16] These variables are not currently incorporated into the Columbus EARS system.

Time and location of office beat are particularly important. Currently, the EARS committee only examines officers with the highest rates of use of force and/or complaints, without accounting for differences in the contexts and communities in which individual officers work. Even a single use of force on a beat where these are very rare can be the first sign of a potentially troubling pattern of behavior yet would not be flagged under the current system.

One benefit of a revamped EARS system is the ability to identify and address patterns and practices outside the formal disciplinary system prescribed by the collective bargaining agreement. Rather than relying on punitive measures, a true early-warning system allows supervisors to intervene in real-time with resources to support an officer's success.

A truly effective early-warning system should be prospective, with effective interventions for officers flagged as being at-risk of engaging of misconduct (without yet having done anything wrong). Such a system might involve retraining, mentoring, counseling or other types of support, without being perceived as being punitive or risking distorting officer behavior.

Recommendation 66: Implement an annual survey of rank-and-file officers to evaluate officer well-being, job satisfaction, and workplace environment.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

The President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing recommends an annual survey of rank-and-file officers asking them to evaluate policing strategies "…in terms of enhancing or hurting their ability to connect with the community." A more in-depth survey of CDP employees, in addition to a series of focus groups, was conducted by Matrix Consulting. The results prove the value of these survey instruments, documenting experiences and perceived bias within the Division based on gender and race.

Recommendation 67: Implement annual survey of rank-and-file officers to evaluate policing strategies in terms of enhancing or hurting officer ability to connect with the community.
Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

For background information on this recommendation, see rationale for Recommendation 66.

---

[16] Carton, Samuel et al.., 2016, "Identifying Police Officers at Risk of Adverse Events," paper available for download at https://www.kdd.org/kdd2016/subtopic/view/identifying-police-officers-at-risk-of-adverse-events.

This page is intentionally blank.

Labor Relations

Recommendation 68: Terminate the leave forfeiture option allowing officers to claim up to 120 hours of accrued sick time for suspensions resulting from corrective/disciplinary action.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 2 Abstain, 1 Absent

The Commission supports this change to the FOP CBA, to ensure officers under suspension may not avoid the intended effects of this action by simply substituting other forms of time. This provision significantly decreases the deterring effect of such corrective/disciplinary action.

Recommendation 69: Amend the length of time an officer's written reprimand for excessive use of force can be removed from a personnel file from 3 years to the duration of employment with CDP.
Adopted by a vote of 10 Yes, 2 No, 3 Abstain, 2 Absent

The Commission expended considerable time and debate prior to the final vote on this recommendation. CDP leadership is encouraged to consider the full transcript of that debate, as well as the research records attached to the report, when considering this recommendation.

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

INDEPENDENT INVESTIGATIONS

This page is intentionally blank.

Independent Investigations

Recommendation 70: Establish an independent civilian review board. We understand this recommendation to be extremely complex and requires time to research, benchmark and review by the City of Columbus elected officials, leadership of Public Safety, the Chief of Police and FOP leadership. Progress on the pursuit of this recommendation is to be reported in the CDP annual report. A diverse work group comprised of internal and external stakeholders should be established within a year of the installation of the permanent Chief of Police.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

During public forums held by the Commission, several community members expressed a desire for the creation of an independent civilian review board in Columbus. This board would increase the sense of accountability of CDP and would build trust with the community.

Modeled after boards that exist in other major metropolitan areas such as Baltimore, New York, and Los Angeles, the board could include functions such as review of complaints related to instances of excessive force, bias, and unprofessional behavior. The board would review such claims and make recommendations to the appropriate city entity.

During the Commission's deliberations on this recommendation, it was clear that the complexity of creating a board that serves the needs of our community in a just, equitable, and legally-permissible manner requires intensive research, dialogue, and negotiation. As a result, the Commission does not prescribe the specific form or function of a civilian review board. Rather, the Commission recommends an inclusive, transparent, and deliberative public process to refine and recommend for implementation the charter, contractual and potential legal changes necessary to implement a civilian review board in the City of Columbus.

Recommendation 71: Amend City Charter to create a city-funded, operationally-independent, professionally-staffed, public-facing entity empowered to participate fully in criminal or administrative investigations involving CDP personnel.
Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain

A variety of national commissions and professional bodies, such as the Taskforce on 21st Century Policing, have recognized the trust- and legitimacy-building benefits of using an independent process for investigating police use of force.

- The President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing[17] included Action Item 2.2.2, which called for policies that "…mandate external and independent criminal investigations in cases of police use of force resulting in death, officer-involved shootings resulting in injury or death, or in-custody deaths."

---

[17] United States Department of Justice, Community Oriented Policing Services, "President Obama's Task Force on 21st Century Policing: Final Report." https://cops.usdoj.gov/pdf/taskforce/taskforce_finalreport.pdf accessed 12/01/2019.

- The Ohio Task Force on Community-Police Relations included recommendations from multiple members for agencies to use "...an outside prosecutor and an independent special investigation unit to ensure that police-involved uses of deadly force cases are conducted in an unbiased and proper manner."[18]
- The Major Cities Chiefs Association has also published a report[19], titled "Independent Investigations of Officer-Involved Shootings," concluding that "...investigative independence includes both substantial costs and offers clear benefits."

Our recommendation for independent investigations is not meant to imply that the Commission found problems or biases in the current system, or that the Commission lacks confidence in the technical ability of the Internal Affairs Bureau ("IAB") to carry out fair investigations. In fact, some Commissioners were quite impressed with the IAB staff and their commitment to protecting the integrity and reputation of the division. Further, this recommendation is not designed to address specific, identified problems with the current process.

This recommendation is based on the recognition of legitimation challenges inherent in the current IAB process, which has a deleterious effect on CDP's standing within the broader community. Despite one's view of IAB, there is considerable distrust of the division among segments of our community and skepticism that the agency is capable of fairly policing itself and the behavior of its officers. Such lack of trust impedes the division's ability to build strong ties with the people it serves and protects. It also impedes the ability of officers to do their job effectively.

Creating an independent entity to participate in investigations, the Commission believes, can help eliminate major sources of distrust between the community and the police. However, the Commission is sensitive to competing concerns and considerations, including the requirement that any system retain the trust of officers, possess the technical expertise to properly conduct sensitive investigations, and ensure fair, equitable, and legally-required treatment of involved.

Thinking through specific alternatives, the Commission reviewed a report on "Independent Investigation Models" prepared for the Seattle Police Commission.[20] The report reviewed different ways various jurisdictions have implemented independent investigations, as well as unintended problems or issues that have emerged.

As Columbus implements its own system, it is important that our community learn from the experiences of other jurisdictions. Among lessons we see as valuable include the following:

---

[18] Ohio Office of Criminal Justice Services, "Ohio Task Force on Community-Police Relations Final Report." https://www.ocjs.ohio.gov/ohiocollaborative/links/recommendations.pdf accessed 12/01/2019.
[19] Major Cities Chiefs Association, "Independent Investigations of Officer-Involved Shootings." https://www.majorcitieschiefs.com/pdf/news/ois_fiinal_report_9_27_18.pdf accessed 12/01/2019.
[20] Seattle Community Police Commission, "Investigation Models." https://www.seattle.gov/Documents/Departments/CommunityPoliceCommission/SDFITInvestigationModels.pdf accessed 12/01/2019.

- Under a 2014 law in Wisconsin requiring independent investigations of officer-involved deaths, the state Department of Justice's Division of Criminal Investigations has led most investigations. These investigations typically take between one and four months to complete. Challenges this system has faced include: (1) delays in evidence gathering; and (2) lingering perception of bias or conflict of interest.

- Under a 2015 law in Connecticut mandating independent prosecutors in officer-involved deaths, a special prosecutor from a different jurisdiction is brought in to carry out investigations in cooperation with the State Police. The prosecutor submits her findings to the Chief State's Attorney, which makes the ultimate decision about whether to prosecute. One major disadvantage with this approach is that investigations typically take at least one year to conclude.

- Under a 2015 law in Utah, independent investigations of officer-involved critical incidents are required. In practice, investigations are typically done by law enforcement personnel from other law enforcement agencies. One major limitation is persistent mistrust and perception of conflicts of interest, as the local police chief has the discretion to choose which agency will investigate.

Considering the experiences of other jurisdictions, the Commission believes an effective independent oversight and investigatory model should consider the following:

- Professional staffing to carry out investigations.
- Local presence, to allow for timely response to scenes of critical incidents.
- Ability to full participate in all aspects of the investigation.
- Authority to issue independent judgements or conclusions about the outcomes of the investigations or the process.
- An accessible, public-facing website where reports and other public records are posted as promptly as possible.

Note that this recommendation for an independent investigatory body is distinct from a civilian review board or an independent prosecutor. Our recommendation could be implemented in concert with these other reforms, or could be enacted on its own, retaining the existing model of chain-of-command disciplinary review and the role of the county prosecutor.

Recommendation 72: Implement a process for independent investigation of 1) officer use of force, including but not limited to, officer use of force resulting in death, officer involved shootings, and in-custody injuries and deaths; and 2) complaints about serious Columbus Division of Police officer misconduct.
Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

For background information on this recommendation, see rationale for Recommendation 70.

This page is intentionally blank.

MISCELLANEOUS

This page is intentionally blank.

January 28, 2020

Miscellaneous

Recommendation 73: Adopt a specific youth policy to ensure officer respond appropriately to youth in a way that promotes youth and public safety.

Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

This recommendation operationalizes other items related to juvenile justice, such as new curriculum and training standards. Suggested resources for this type of policy or program can be found at: http://strategiesforyouth.org/for-police/training/ (Policing the Teen Brain report); and, the CDP's TAPS curriculum could also be used and given to a broader swath of cadets/officers.

Recommendation 74: CDP officers should be subject to mandatory, post-incident drug and alcohol testing immediately following an officer involved shooting or a deadly use of force incident. The policy should include the following requirements: 1) Every officer involved in an officer-involved shooting or a deadly use of force incident must submit to drug and alcohol testing, and 2) the drug and alcohol testing must be completed no later than the end of the involved officer's shift.

Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 2 Abstain, 1 Absent

Columbus police officers are not currently required to immediately submit to drug and alcohol testing following an officer involved shooting or deadly use of force incident. The lack of this type of accountability creates mistrust between the CDP and the community.

The Columbus Division of Police should adopt a policy regarding drug and alcohol testing immediately following an officer involved shooting or any deadly use of force incident. The policy should include the following requirements: 1) Every officer involved in an officer-involved shooting must submit to drug and alcohol testing, and 2) the drug and alcohol testing must be completed no later than the end of the involved officer's shift.

These recommendations are very similar to legislation implemented in the state of Illinois that requires every law enforcement agency within the state to adopt a post-incident drug testing policy.[21] Several other police departments have adopted similar policies.

---

[21] http://www.ilga.gov/legislation/ilcs/documents/005007270K1-25.htm

Department	Post-Use of Force Chemical Test Required	Post-Accident Chemical Test Required
St. Louis (Missouri) Metropolitan Police Dept.	X	X
Charlotte-Mecklenburg (North Carolina) Police Dept.	X	X
Craig (Colorado) Police Dept.	X	X
Chicago (Illinois) Police Dept.	X	X
Joplin (Missouri) Police Dept.	X	X
New York (New York) Police Dept.	X	X
Eagar (Arizona) Police Dept.	X	X
Mount Pleasant (South Carolina) Police Dept.	X	X

Recommendation 75: Implement a residency incentive program for CDP employees.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

CDP should investigate incentive programs for employees who reside in the City of Columbus. For example, the City of Atlanta has established a home down payment assistance program in partnership with the police department, police foundation and land bank. Such programs provide added incentive for police officers to live in the communities they serve. Such a linkage to the community will provide greater context and understanding between police and the community.

Recommendation 76: The city should have an internal whistleblower "hotline" or access-point that can allow anonymous submissions from officers of abuse, racism, harassment, etc. Much like the new Columbus Police App that allows for anonymous officer misconduct, but designed for internal review specifically by and directly to the Chief's Office.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

As an issue raised at the first public hearing, officers need a resource to anonymously submit a tip or complaint about abuse, racism, or harassment from other officers without fear of retaliation. Such complaints would not be directed to an Internal Affairs investigative process as the Commission believes such action risks having the same repercussions that exist now. However,

the Commission does not make the recommendation with a specific destination for such a complaint, only that the Mayor's office establish a destination.

Recommendation 77: CDP should add an additional property room in a central location.
Adopted by a vote of 12 Yes, 2 No, 2 Abstain, 1 Absent

Currently, there is only one property room in the City of Columbus, which is located at 724 E. Woodrow Avenue, Columbus, Ohio 43217. This Southside location presents several possible issues because it takes officers, especially those who are not immediately assigned to that particular area of the city, a significant amount of travel time to get there. This takes officers off the street who otherwise, could be actively promoting public safety and serving their communities. Anecdotally, the distance of the location also discourages some officers from collecting and/or submitting evidence because they know it will take a significant amount of time from their shift. Consequently, when officers are away from their shift, unable to fight crime, and/or fail to serve their community, then confidence and trust for the police is diminished among the public.

To ameliorate these issues, the Commission recommends that the City of Columbus establish another property room in a more centralized location. The Commission notes that CDP leadership has expressed serious concerns about the cost and logistics of duplicating the services currently centralized at the property room and encourage the City to explore options that may be more officer-friendly and cost-effective, such as mobile property rooms.

Recommendation 78: To better evaluate deployment methods and strategic initiatives (i.e., Safe Streets), data analysts should be trained in modern evaluation techniques and such techniques should be applied consistently to all Division initiatives and programs.
Adopted by a vote of 16 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 0 Absent

Over the past three decades, policing has been transformed by increasing use of data analysis to achieve strategic targeting of police resources. Our sense is that CDP is somewhat up-to-date on this front especially in the realm of hot-spot policing. However, ex-post evaluation of enforcement initiatives remains relatively rare and, when conducted, does not use the most modern methods for effective program evaluation.

For example, the Hot Topics Subcommittee reviewed CDP's evaluation of the scaled-up Safe Streets initiative. The primary method for evaluation was a comparison of crime trends in neighborhoods across years, with a one-year decrease in crime in Linden that coincided with the Safe Streets program attributed to the program. This type of evaluation is unconvincing. For example, it is vulnerable to the well-known statistical phenomenon of "regression to the mean" — unexpected departure from previous trends, such as a sudden jump in crime, is likely to be transitory and reverse itself naturally, with the data returning to its longer-run trends without any intervention. Crime declines in a specific neighborhood following a sudden one-year increase may

reflect simple "regression to the mean," rather than being the result of a specific enforcement effort.

Modern statistical approaches exist for carrying more rigorous evaluations and are used by other agencies, including the Chicago Police Department. For example, analysts can "match" precincts based on pre-intervention crime trends, and use these matched units as a natural "control group" for tracking the likely trends that would have been observed in the absence of an intervention.

The Commission believes CDP data analysts should be trained on modern evaluation methods and that these should be used to rigorously evaluate every major division enforcement initiative or policy for effectiveness. Groundwork for these evaluations should be part of the development of such initiatives. Lastly, CDP can benefit from cross-departmental and public/private data analysis partnerships.

Recommendation 79: Update the uniform standards to allow for culturally-specific head coverings.
Adopted by a vote of 15 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 1 Absent

Current uniform standards do not allow use of culturally-specific head coverings, such as a dastār, hijab, or tichel. Law enforcement agencies across the country have successfully established uniform standards that allow for these head coverings. Columbus should do the same.

Recommendation 80: The Mayor is encouraged to work with city officials, prosecutors, and or the Ohio legislature to eliminate the use of the felony murder statute.
Adopted by a vote of 14 Yes, 0 No, 1 Abstain, 2 Absent

Some jurisdictions across the country are moving away from enforcement of felony-murder statutes. The Mayor is encouraged to work with city officials, prosecutors, and/or the legislature to eliminate use of such statutes.

As noted during debate on this recommendation, Ohio has established statutes that designate as "felony murder" homicide occurring during the commission or attempted commission of certain crimes. Further, this recommendation is outside the scope of the CCSAC.

APPENDIX

This page is intentionally blank.

Appendix

The following information is a complete and itemized description of the contents which were presented over the course of the past 18 months to the Columbus Safety Advisory Commission. As the size of some documents is quite large, the online record of the Appendix can be conveniently found on the City of Columbus' dedicated webpage at the following address: https://www.columbus.gov/safetycommission/. The Appendix lists in chronological order documents from all 24 meetings including materials under general and additional reading sections. Each listing is hyperlinked to the referenced material. In some cases, the Appendix also lists a video of the meeting, hyperlinked to connect the reader to the uploaded media. The online record of any hyperlinked video in the Appendix can be found at the City's YouTube webpage https://www.youtube.com/user/cityofcolumbus.

A. General Information
   1. Police Executive Research Forum Review – IAB 2016
      a. Columbus IAB Implementation Matrix
      b. PERF Review of IAB
   2. Bylaws
   3. Descriptive Profile of Columbus Division of Police
   4. Pledge of Ethical Conduct
   5. Ride Along Request
   6. Safety Commission Announcement 3.8.18 (YouTube Video Link)
   7. Safety Commission Consultant RFP
   8. Summary of Comprehensive Neighborhood Safety Strategy

B. Meeting 1 - April 12th, 2018 - Introductions
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 4.12.18
   3. Columbus Results Presentation
   4. April 2018 Public Safety Commission Presentation
   5. Bryan Clark Remarks
   6. Bylaws

C. Meeting 2 – May 9th, 2018 – Legal Tactics for Law Enforcement Officers
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 5.9.18
   3. Legal Tactics for Law Enforcement Officers

D. Meeting 3 – May 31st, 2018 – Constitutional Standards for Policing
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 5.31.18
   3. Jeff Furbee Presentation
   4. Police Legal Advisory

E. Meeting 4 – June 13th, 2018 – Civil Service Process for Hiring; CDP Selection Process and Background Investigation Process
1. Agenda
2. Meeting Minutes 6.13.18
3. Civil Service Commission Presentation
4. CDP Selection Process
5. CDP Background Investigation Process
6. Police Legal Advisor Update 6.8.18
7. Meeting Video (You Tube Video Link)

F. Meeting 5 – July 11th, 2018 – Recruitment SWOT; Recruitment Pipeline; Polygraph Overview; Police Hiring Process
1. Agenda
2. Meeting Minutes – 7.11.18
3. Recruitment SWOT
4. Recruitment Pipeline Project
5. Polygraph Memo
6. Police Hiring Process
7. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

G. Meeting 6 – August 1st, 2018 – Community Engagement and Outreach
1. Agenda
2. Meeting Minutes 8.1.18
3. Community Engagement and Outreach Handout
4. 2017 Community Engagement Report
5. Blockwatch Handbook Revised March 2014
6. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

H. Meeting 7 – August 20th, 2018 – Recruitment Data Analysis
1. Agenda
2. Meeting Minutes 8.20.18
3. PowerPoint CDP Applicant Data Vlad Kogan
4. Analysis of CDP Applicant Data
5. Committee Descriptions
6. Community Listening Sessions
7. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

I. Meeting 8 – September 12th, 2018 – 21st Century Policing
1. Agenda
2. Meeting Minutes 9.12.18
3. 21st Century Policing
4. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

J. Meeting 9 – September 25th, 2018 – Training Bureau Overview; Ohio Peace Officer Training; Basic Training; Advanced Training; Crisis Intervention Training
1. Agenda
2. Meeting Minutes 9.25.18
3. Basic Training Slides
4. Advance Training Slides

5. Presentation Packet
6. Basic Training Audit Sheet
7. Certification Recommendations
8. Testing Academy Info
9. Meeting Video (You Tube Video Link)

K. Meeting 10 – October 18, 2018 – Crisis Intervention Training; Matrix Consulting presentation
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 10.18.18
   3. CIT Presentation
   4. Matrix Presentation
   5. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

L. Meeting 11 – November 1st, 2018 – Collective Bargaining; FOP Contract
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 11.1.18
   3. Collective Bargaining Presentation
   4. Pamela J. Gordon Bio
   5. Ron Linville Bio
   6. FOP Contract 2014-2017
   7. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

M. Meeting 12 – November 14th, 2018 – Benchmark Analytics presentation; EARS presentation
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 11.14.18
   3. Benchmark Presentation Description
   4. EARS Presentation
   5. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

N. Meeting 13 – December 13th, 2018 – Collective Bargaining; CDP Discipline Process; Arbitration
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 12.13.18
   3. Collective Bargaining
   4. CDP Discipline Process
   5. Arbitration
   6. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

O. Meeting 14 – January 10th, 2019 – Subcommittee Reports; Matrix Consulting Interim Report
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 1.10.19
   3. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

P. Meeting 15 – January 23rd, 2019 – Officer Wellness Presentation
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 1.23.19

3. Officer Wellness Presentation
4. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

Q. Meeting 16 – March 14, 2019 – Use of Force presentation; CDP Directives
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 3.14.19
   3. Use of Force Presentation
   4. CDP Directives Manual
   5. Use of Force Review
   6. Use of Force Report
   7. Use of Taser Report
   8. Data Process Worksheet
   9. Meeting Video (You Tube Video Link)

R. Meeting 17 – March 27th, 2019 – Use of Force
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 3.27.19
   3. Matrix Use of Force Presentation National Trends & Best Practices
   4. National Consensus Policy and Discussion Paper on Use of Force
   5. Civilian Oversight of the Police in Major Cities
   6. Guiding Principles on the Use of Force
   7. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

S. Meeting 18 - April 18th, 2019 – Juvenile Justice
   1. Agenda
   2. Meeting Minutes 4.18.19
   3. Juvenile Justice Presentation
   4. Gabriella Celeste Presentation
   5. Biographies B. Burns and G. Celeste
   6. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

T. Meeting 19 – June 5th, 2019 – Public Forum
   1. Agenda
   2. Speaker Database
   3. Submitted Emails and Documents
   4. Submitted Miscellaneous Documents
   5. Submitted Speaker Slips
   6. Meeting Video Part 1 (YouTube Video Link) Part 2 (You Tube Video Link)

U. Meeting 20 – July 15th, 2019 – Subcommittee Updates
   1. Minutes 7.15.19

V. Meeting 21 – September 6th, 2019 – Chief Quinlan and Matrix Presentations
   1. Minutes 9.6.19
   2. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

W. Meeting 22 – September 16th, 2019 – Subcommittee Presentations
   1. Agenda
   2. Minutes 9.16.19

3. Hiring Presentation
4. Training Presentation
5. 21st Century Policing Presentation
6. Hot Topics Presentation
7. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

X. Meeting 23 – October 1st, 2019 – Public Forum
1. Submitted Public Speaker Slips
2. Submitted Email Testimony
3. Meeting Video (YouTube Video Link)

Y. Meeting 24 – October 22, 2019 – Final Commission Vote on Recommendations
1. Agenda
2. Minutes 10.22.19
3. Training Final Recommendations
4. Recruitment Final Recommendations
5. Voting Tally Sheet
6. Meeting Video YouTube Video Link

Z. Recommended Readings
1. Austin, TX Community Policing Report
2. Police Use of Force Examination of Modern Policing Practices
3. Polygraph
4. President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing
5. Proactive Policing
6. Safe Streets Report